

Equivalence Questions of Irony and Humor in Haldun Taner's Literary Works Translated into Georgian Language ("It was Raining in Shishane", "One Minute to Twelve", "Two Neighbors", "Binocular")

Muzaffer KIR *

Abstract

Literary translations from other languages into Georgian have been interestingly chased by the Georgian literary readers. Georgian literary readers sometimes pay more attention to "how the translated" than "what the translated work says?"

The case of translation competency of irony and humor into Georgian language of modern Turkish writer Haldun Taner (1915-1986)'s literary works like "It was raining in Shishane", "One minute to twelve", "Two Neighbors", "Binocular" presents tremendous interest in terms of translation studies.

Haldun Taner's literary works have been focused ironically and masterly on some social topics leaping to the eye of Turkish society as *inequity*, *unfairness*, *impropriety*, i.e. Taner, in his Turkish sentence "Çoğu hayvanların kulağı insanınkinden delik"/The ear of most animals is more 'hole' than people's one" means that due to some negative features obtained in his life time like arrogance...etc. humankind fails to carry out its dominant responsibilities to be carried out in this world life.

The above-mentioned sentence was translated into Georgian language on semantic basis, that's what Turkish author wanted to mean in his own language. If the translator had chosen another way of the field of translation then the meaning of this polysemous sentence would have been damaged.

It is a sign that the translator of target language (into Georgian) has deep competency in terms of language ability and he is deeply familiar with the source/Turkish cultural codes. This paper will try to deal with the deepness and vastness of coincidence of Turkish sentences translated into Georgian language in terms of semantics.

Keywords: Equivalence case, Haldun Taner, irony/humor, translation studies, translator competency

Introduction

Translation of valuable literary texts has always been an object of interest for Georgians. This was the primary reason for translation of novels of a famous Turkish writer – Haldun Taner into Georgian. This very task was accomplished in a high professional manner by a well-known Georgian translator Lia Chlaidze.

The Equivalence Case Haldun Taner's Translations

Haldun Taner is a famous Turkish writer of a twentieth century. His works have been translated into many languages. The writer was born in 1915 in Istanbul. In 1950 Haldun Taner graduated from the faculty of literature, department of philology, University of Istanbul. The writer has written twelve plays and thirteen cabaret plays. He passed away in 7 May of 1986, in Istanbul. His novels are translated into Georgian Language as well.

Caucasian House, together with an Agency of Cooperation and Development (TİKA) has released the collection of novels of a famous Turkish dramatist Hal-

dun Taner entitled "The Rain Down on Istanbul". This collection of novels includes the novels and plays of a writer which were translated from Turkish into Georgian by a well-known Turkologist – Lia Chlaidze.

The ancestors of Haldun Taner, by the surname of Tavdgiridze, were originally from Kobuleti, Georgia (Chlaidze, 2004).

The writer describes the chaotic and life full of contradictions of a big city in his novels in a remarkable way. Irony and humor hold the central place in his novels. In such a way, the writer critically depicts not only the issues of a social life but many aspects of personal affairs as well.

Haldun Taner tries to show the weaker and negative parts of particular individuals and especially, the disingenuousness of individuals which is a material for of humor in general. Within this context, some original parts and those of Georgian translations of Haldun Taner's novels are worth of attention:

In the novel entitled "The Rain Was Pouring Down on Shishane" the plot concerns a certain type of experiment which the conclusion is made that the eyes

* Associate professor, Faculty of Education and Humanities, International Black Sea University, Tbilisi, Georgia, E-mail: mkir@ibsu.edu.ge

of a horse perceives objects in a twice bigger scale than a human eye does. According to Haldun Taner one German scientist made such a comment on this issue: "Her şeyi böyle olduğundan daha büyük görüş, hayvanda dolayısıyla bir aşâğılık duygusu yaratmış ve onu daha ilk çağlardan itibaren insanın hizmetkârı derekesine indirmiştir (Ibid, p. 212)".

Perception of reality on a bigger scale has developed a lower sense of dignity in animals and has turned them into servants of human beings since the prehistoric era.

Georgian translation: "ამრიგად, სამყაროს აღქმა გადიდებული მასშტაბით არის მიზეზი, რამაც დაუკარგა ცხოველებს საკუთარი ღირსების გრძნობა და ჯერ კიდევ პრეისტორიულ ხანაში აქცია ისინი კაცთა მოღვმის თვინიერ მსახურებად" (Ibid, p. 13).

"In this way, perception of reality on a bigger scale was the reason for animals that they have lost their sense of dignity and has turned them into gentle servants of human beings since the prehistoric era".

The author approaches to the results of a German scientist with doubt not agreeing with it and continues on his discourse as he evaluates the issue critically:

Original Turkish text: "Fotoğrafçının denemeyi nasıl bir at gözû ile yaptığını bilmiyoruz.Ama bana öyle gelir ki, Alman'ın hipotezi olsa olsa sûtçü, sucu, çöpcü beygirleri gibi proleter atlar için geçerli olsa gerekir. Ağa Han'ın o Lord sülaleleri gibi şecereleri tutulan, has ahırlarda bin bir itina ile yetiştirilen aristokrat atları, imkan var mı insanları olduğundan büyük görsünler. Büyüklüğû geçtik tam ebatla bile göremezler. Onlar yüksek sosyete ile iyice haşır neşir olduklarından, insanı dürbünün tersinden seyreder gibi, küçük, küçücük görmeğe iyice alışmışlardır" (Ibid, p. 212).

"We do not know which horse's eye has the photographer used for this experiment. But i think the hypothesis of a German scientist can be fitted to those hacks which drag milk, water and trash and form the proletariat of horses. For take a look at Aga Han's swift steeds that live in brilliant stables and enjoy all the goodness! The posterity of these Aristocrats is being figured out with a certainty of Lords genealogy. So it can be untruth that their eyes see men in a larger scale! Forget the bigger scale; they probably do not perceive us in a natural scale, as we are. Being accepted to a higher society, they see us as we were tiny, like they were looking at us through the opposite side of a pair of glasses".

Georgian translation: "არ ვიცი, ფოტოგრაფმა ამ ცდისათვის რომელი ცხენის თვალი გამოიყენა, მაგრამ, ვფიქრობ, გერმანელი მეცნიერის ჰიპოთეზა დიდი-დიდი, იმ ჯაგლაგებზე გავრცელდეს, რძეს, წყალსა და ნაგავს რომ ეზიდებიან და ცხენთა პროლეტარიატს ქმნიან, თორემ, აბა, ერთი, ალა ხანის ტაიჭებიცა ნახეთ, ბრწყინვალე საჭინობებში რომ ცხოვრობენ და მოვლა-პატივი რომ არ აკლიათ! ამ არისტოკრატთა შთამამოვლობას ხომ ლორდთა გენეალოგიის სიზუსტით აღგენენ? რა საფიქრებელია, თითქოს კაცი მათაც გადიდებულად ეჩვენებოდეთ?! გადიდებული იქით იყოს, ალბათ, ბუნებრივი ზომითაც ვერ აღგვიქვამენ. მაღალ

საზოგადოებაში მიღებულთ ჩვენ პანანინა და უსუსურნი ვეჩვენებით, თითქოს შებრუნებული ღერბინდით გვიყურებენო" (Ibid, p. 14).

"We do not know which horse's eye has the photographer used for this experiment but i think the hypothesis of a German scientist can be fitted to those hacks which drag milk, water and trash and form the proletariat of horses. For take a look at Aga Han's swift steeds that live in brilliant stables and enjoy all the goodness! The posterity of these Aristocrats is being figured out with a certainty of Lords genealogy. So it can be untruth that their eyes see men in a larger scale! Forget the bigger scale; they probably do not perceive us in a natural scale, as we are. Being accepted to a higher society, they see us as we were tiny and helpless, like they were looking at us through the opposite side of a pair of glasses".

At a first glance, the above given text shows that the author criticizes an animal - a horse, in this case, but this is not the case here, actually. From the beginning, the author elaborates on an experiment that was conducted on horse but then he goes to a human in an ironical manner. In short, using thematic of a horse, the author criticizes humans in an ironical way as a human is being meant under a "horse". Two different types of objects are being compared here. According to author metaphorical references, the one who lives in a higher society sees the people of lower social classes as inferior ones. This point was caught by the Georgian translator. It can be said that the translator avoided of translation of Turkish text word by word, instead she preferred catching of language deepness and intention of writer, namely Haldun Taner.

The main character of Haldun Taner's novel entitled "Pair of Glasses" is Hidjabi Bey which spends the last years of his life with a pair of glasses in his hands. The spheres of his interest are the nearest „waters and land“. He is so fond of this business that he bought three binoculars (one of them left from his grandpa). This fact is being explained in the original Turkish text in details which is translated in an understandable way in Georgian translation:

Original Turkish text: 1) "Rahmetli deniz harita subayı dedesinden kalma; tek gözlü boru gibi uzun korsan dürbünü ki, en uzak mesafeler için. Yani:

Kuzey-doğuda: Büyük ve Küçük Çekmece ile, Acıbadem dolayları.

Güney-doğuda: Kınalı, Burgaz...

2) 8/30 objektiv Carl-Zeiss marka asker dürbünü ki, orta mesafeler için.

Bunun da görüş alanı:

Güney-doğuda: kalamış koyu...

Kuzey-doğuda: Fenerbahçe, Mendirek...

3) Bir arttırmada, Ermeni bir madamın terekesinden ucuza kapattığı 1890 modeli bir opera dürbünü...

Sarp bir kale burcunu andıran dört yana nazır yukarı kat odasından uzun boru dürbünü ile ufukları gözlerken Hicabi Bey Andrea Dorya zamanından kalma ihtiyar bir korsandır..." (Ibid, p. 188)

Georgian translation: "ერთი, ცხონებული მტურმანი პაპისაგან მემკვიდრეობით მიღებული

მეკობრის ჭოგრიტი, შორი მანძილებისათვის ჰქონდა განკუთვნილი. ამ ჭოგრიტით აკვირდებოდა იგი ჩრდილო-აღმოსავლეთით დიდ ჩამლიჯას, მცირე ჩამლიჯასა და აჯიბეის მიდამოებს სამხრეთ-აღმოსავლეთით – ქინალის, ბურგაზის...

მეორე 8/30 ობიექტივანი კარლ ცეისის მარკის სამხედრო დურბინდი – საშუალო სიშორისათვის.

მისი დაკვირვების არე იყო სამხრეთ-აღმოსავლეთით კალამიშის ყურე...

მესამე – 1890 წლის მოდელის თეატრალური დურბინდი (ვიღაც სომეხი ქალის მემკვიდრეობა იყიდებოდა აუქციონზე და იქ იათვად ჩაივლო ხელში)...

ჰიჯაბი ბეის ოთახი გემო სართულზეა, ოთხივ მხრივ ფანჯარა აქვს და ციხე კოშკსა ჰგავს. როცა ჰიჯაბი ბეი იქიდან გრძელი ჭოგრიტით იცქირება, მოგვაგონებთ ანდრია დორიას დროინდელ ცალხელა, კოჭლ მეკობრეს" (Ibid, p. 165).

"One binocular left from his navigator grandpa which he used for long distances. He used to observe the North-East of Great Chamlidja, Minor Chamlidja and Adjibey with that binocular; From the South-East – Kinali, Burgazi...

The second one – 8/30 objective of Carl-Zeiss military binocular he used for middle distances.

The area of his observations was the South-East coast of Kalamish bay...

The third one – of an opera binocular of 1890 year model (the inheritance of one Armenian lady sold on auction, so he bought it there in cheaply)...

The room of Hidjabi Bey is on an upper floor surrounded with windows from all four sides and looks much like a fortress. When Hidjabi Bey is looking from there with his long binocular, he reminds of a one handed pirate from the era of Andrea Dorya".

In the above given episodes and especially in the last one we can see that the author depicts the behavior of Hidjabi Bey mockingly, in an ironical manner. Sometimes author refers the main character of his novel not by his name but uses an ironical forms instead: Hazret (Excellency) in which a reader clearly recognizes a mockery tone. The author's attitude towards this character (together with irony mixed with mockery) slowly turns into critique:

Original Turkish text: "Hazret yalnız seyretse iyi. Hayır. Önce dürbünün, sonra da o iki iri mavi objektifin süzgecinden geçen manzaralar, eski model bir körüklü fotoğraf makinesi büyüklüğündeki o kavun biçimi kafada cama geçer, evrilip çevrilip banyo edilir. Sonra da laf olarak ağız çekmecesinden dışarı çıkar" (Ibid, p. 198).

Georgian translation: "დიდად პატივცემული ბეი განა მხოლოდ უთვალთვალვებს? – რა ბრძანებაა! სურათები გაივლის დურბინდის ლინზაში, ბეის თვალეში – დიდ ლურჯ ობიექტივებში – შემდეგ ფოტოფირფიტაზე აღიბეჭდება მის თავში ძველებური, საბერველიანი ფოტოაპარატისხელა რომ არის და ნესვის ფორმა აქვს. აქვე გადატრიალ-გადმოტრიალდება, გაირეცხება და სიტყვებად ქცეული ჰირის უჯრით გარეთ გამოვა" (Ibid, p. 166).

"His excellency does not only observe the environment, not at all! Pictures pass through the lenses of a binocular, his eyes – big blue lenses – than it is imprinted in his head like pictures in an old photo camera. Those pictures are being developed right there as they are printed out through the drawer of his mouth.

Here the author criticizes not only the behavior conducted by Hidjabi Bey with his binocular but his gossiping as well..."

As for the Georgian translation of a given episode it can be said and as it is clearly seen that L. Chlaidze consciously and carefully conducts the task undertaken by her throughout the whole text, but we emphasize her devotion and responsibility to the correct translation of an original Turkish text. In the above given episode the translator reflects the author's reference by using the Turkish word "Bey/Sir" in Georgian translation instead of Georgian equivalent Batoni (ბატონი).

In the same manner, the following critical expression in Turkish has been translated into Georgian in a very correct way: "Ayaklar baş oldu, başlar ayak oldu" (Ibid, p. 126); which means: promotion of worthless individuals and leaving honorable ones behind...

Here as well the author criticizes the falsity within society in an ironical way. The given expression has been translated correctly and according to its original meaning in a Georgian version: The head has turned into legs as legs have turned to head... (Ibid, p. 65). The author does not only criticize the negative sides of humans, he also shows us their weakness and helplessness. He (author) reaches this very goal by comparing the abilities of humans and animals with each other. For example, in the following episode: "Çoğu hayvanların kulagı insaninkinden delik" (Georgian translation: "უმეტესი ცხოველის ყური ადამიანის ყურზე უფრო გახვრეტილია") (Ibid, p. 186). – "The ears of most of the animals are bigger than those of a human". Scientists also claim that animals have more developed ability of perceiving external sounds than humans do. The author shows this negative (according to him) side of humans by comparing this very ability with the same ability of animals.

As for the Georgian translation of the above given sentence, it should mentioned that the high qualification of the translator is clearly seen. If the translator would have translated the given sentence word by word, we would have a following expression: "The ears of most of the animals have bigger holes than those of humans" as this kind of translation would cause the misunderstanding in readers. Shortly, it would leave a negative impression on them (readers) but fortunately, the translator translates the given phrase into Georgian correctly leaving no place for doubt for the reader:

"ცხოველს ადამიანზე მახვილი სმენა აქვს" (Ibid, p. 163).

"Animals have sharper ear than the human does".

Again, the same happiness in the following episodes:

"Şahinler miyoplduğumuza acısa yeri..." (Ibid, p. 186).

Georgian translation: “შევარდენიც, მართალია, რომ ვეცოდებით, ახლომხედველები ხართო” (Ibid, p. 163)

“Falcon too, feels sorry for us and our shortsightedness”.

One more episode expressed with irony:

“Büyüteç teleskoba girdi bize küçüklüğümüzü, mikroskoba girdi büyüklüğümüzü öğretti” (magnifying lens has entered through the telescope and showed us our smallness, it has entered through the microscope and has shown us our hugeness) (Ibid, p. 186).

Georgian translation: “შევიდა იგი ტელესკოპის შემადგენლობაში და დაგვანახა, რაოდენ მცირენი ვართ, შევიდა მიკროსკოპის შემადგენლობაში და გვიჩვენა ჩვენი სიდიდე” (Ibid, p. 163). “As it has entered through the telescope and showed us our smallness, it has entered through the microscope and has shown us our hugeness”.

Conclusion

Comparing the original Turkish text and its Georgian translation with each other we can say that the translator does not offer us an exact and word for word translation. Literally translation of a text may cause misunderstandings and irrelevances in some cases.

As D. Pandjigidze admits it, “A translator observes reality through the eyes of other, than he/she transfers it into his/her native language preserving the form and content of an original work, that is to say: transforms a literary text within the frame his/her own world view (Pandjigidze, 1988)” The process of translation begins with the expression of one’s own thoughts through his/her native language and continues with transferring those thoughts to the foreign language. Eventually, the reader of the foreign language perceives translated text in his/her own way (Kir, 2010: 15).

Finally, it can be said that Haldun Taner’s novels “The Rain Was Pouring Down on Shishane”, “One Minute to Midnight”, “Two Neighbors”, “Binocular” have been translated into Georgian language in such a way that the translator was able to catch Haldun Taner’s expressions’ metaphorical references in her translation. The accurateness of the source text in translated language is very important so that Georgian readers to penetrate distant references of source text. In this case it can be concluded that the Georgian translator Lia Chlaidze accomplished this task.

References

Kir, M. (2010). *Turkish Translation of Nodar Dumbadze’s Novel - I See the Sun*. Unpublished doctorate dissertation.

Novels. (1969). *Sancho’s Morning Walk*. Ankara: Bilgi Publish House

Pandjigidze, D. (1988). *Theory and Practice of Translation*. Tbilisi: Ganatleba

Redhead Amazon. (1988). 3rd Edition. Ankara: Bilgi

Taner, H. (1994). *Collection of Novels*. 4th edition. Istanbul: Bilgi Publish House

Taner, H. (2004). *The Rain Was Pouring Down on Istanbul*. (Translated into Georgian by Lia Chlaidze), Tbilisi: Caucasian House.